From Arabic Style toward Javanese Style: Comparison between Accents of Javanese Recitation and Arabic Recitation

Nur Faizin

Abstract
Moslem scholars have accepted maqamat in reciting the Quran otherwise they have not accepted macapat as Javanese style in reciting the Quran such as recitation in the State Palace in commemoration of Isra’ Miraj 2015. The paper uses a phonological approach to accents in Arabic and Javanese style in reciting the first verse of Surah Al-Isra`. The method used here is analysis of suprasegmental sound (accent) by using Speech Analyzer program and the comparison of these accents is analyzed by descriptive method. By doing so, the author found that: first, there is not any ideological reason to reject Javanese style because both of Arabic and Javanese style have some aspects suitable and unsuitable with Ilm Tajweed; second, the suitability of Arabic style was much than Javanese style; third, it is not right to reject reciting the Quran with Javanese style only based on assumption that it evoked mistakes and errors; fourth, the acceptance of Arabic style as the art in reciting the Quran should rise acceptance of the Javanese style also. So, rejection of reciting the Quran with Javanese style was not due to any reason and it could not be proofed by any logical argument.

Keywords: Recitation, Arabic Style, Javanese Style, Quran.

Introduction
There was a controversial event in commemoration of Isra’ Mi’raj at the State Palace in Jakarta May 15, 2015 ago. The recitation of the Quran in the commemoration was recited with Javanese style (langgam). That was not common performance in relation to such as official event. Muhammad
Yasser Arafat, a lecture of Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University Yogyakarta has been reciting first verse of Al-Isra’ by Javanese style in the front of state officials and delegations of many countries. The recitation also has been living on the national television stations. The recitation has fired many various comments can be divided into supporting and opposing faction. The expert scholars of the Islamic studies also provide support and contrary feedbacks. Some said that the recitation is union between culture of the earth and divine of the heaven. But others said that it is a wrong step, setbacks, and liberalization of Islam in Indonesia.

Indeed, moslem communities in Indonesia and other countries have been familiar with art of recitation. They have known Tausyih and Maqamat or songs in reciting the Quran composed of Bayyati, Shoba, Nahawand, Hijaz, Rast, Sikka, and Jiharka. Indonesian moslem also have been familiar with Maqamat or Nagham in Arabic countries and Langgam in Java. Some evidences of existence of the art are the historical records by a number of international expert reciters (Qâri`) such as Sheikh Muhammad Rif’at (1882-1950), Sheikh Mustafa Ismail (1905-1978), KH. Muammar ZA (1955 - ...) and others. Nevertheless, all the experts moslem scholars have accepted that reciting the holy Quran by tone and melody must be obliged to follow the rules existing in IImTajweed and the theme of accents of recitation currently was included in the Ilm Tajweed issues. The accent (An-Nabr: in Arabic or stress/accent: in English) simply is tones and intonations emerged through a combination of high, low, loud, and soft of sounds.

The big question then is why the majority of moslem have agreed to accept maqâmat or Arabic style, otherwise they could not agreed to accept Javanese style? In order to be realistic and scientific, it is necessary to answer the question through linguistic approach to see whether the Javanese and Arabic style have accents appropriated with linguistic phonological perspective or not? How the accents were contained in both of Arabic and Javanese style? Whether or not they are in accordance with the rules of Linguistics, especially regarding to the accents or stress considered in the Ilm Tajweed? This article is to answer these questions and specifically: (1) to analyze the accent or sound stress in the Javanese style (langgam) and Arabic style (maqâmat) through phonological perspective; (2) to compare both styles based on the rules of Classical Arabic accents; (3) to conclude similarities, differences, and compatibility of these accents with the regulations and rules of accent in phonology.

Recitation analyzed and compared as the data here is the recitation of first verse of Surah Al-Isra with Javanese style that recited by Yasser Arafat at the State Palace in May 15, 2015 and the recitation of same verse with
Arabic style recited by KH. Muammar ZA and H. Chumaidi and it has spread over recording cassettes, internet, and others. The author chooses the best acoustic sound of record then observes and analyzes it acoustically by the program Speech Analyzer v.1.3. Results of the phonological analysis, furthermore, would be compared to accents of Classical Arabic described by a number of linguists, such as Brockelmann (1963), Rodgers (1977), McCarthy (1979), and Hassan (1993).

Arabic Style and Javanese Style in Ideological Perspective

Rejection of Javanese style is often based on an ideological reason that is often considered as if it is religious reason because ideology and religion are belonged to the same logical category and are assuredly in a certain systems and both are concerned at the same time with questions of truth and questions of conduct. Indeed, every moslem may recite the holy Quran with which style he is living in. Reciting the Quran in this archipelago certainly has many various styles due to diversities of the regions and the tribes; Javanese, Sundanese, Batak, Madura, and others. The Javanese style is actually just one kind of archipelagic styles. In the last days, reciting the Quran with Javanese style is known as archipelagic recitation. The Javanese recitation is recited by imitating Javanese poetry called macapat (traditional Javanese prosody).

Macapat is closely associated with the history of Islam in Java. Islam has arrived in Java by Wali Songo (the nine Islamic saints). The success of Islamic missionaries in Java could not be disjointed from local wisdom conducting acculturation between Islamic culture and local culture. Including of the local wisdom is to use songs as a medium to convey teachings of Islam, especially which was done by Sunan Kalijaga (1450-1513 AD) and macapat is one of the prosodic songs of Javanese poeties. Each couplet has some phrase (specific lines), each phrase has a certain number of syllables and rhyming sounds at the end. Macapat is using sound with pentatonic scales of Javanese reference and language in the text media framed by literature and beautiful sentences. According to Suwardi Endraswara, macapat is formed from the words man ca pat, man means faith, ca means five, and pat means guide (five guides of faith). The meaning of faith here is pillars of faith and the meaning of five pillars is the Islam's five pillars (rukn). Macapat was used as a medium to instill guide of Islam's pillars into community of Java by beautiful sentences. There is about ten types of macapat used by Wali Songo: Mijil, Pangkur, Kinanthi, Sinom, Asmaradana, Megatruh, Durma, Maskumambang, Pocung, and Dhandanggula. Dhandanggulais derived from two words dhandhang (canister) and gula (sugar).
which deeply indicates a hope of sweetness. The message of this naming is that the proselytizing is done in the method bringing happiness and successfulness. *MacapatDhandhanggula* and *Khinanti* were created by Sunan Kaliyaga.14 *MacapatDhandhanggula* is prosodic poetry with a flexibility character, for example: prosody *Serat Jayalengkara*:15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prajêng Medhang Kamulan winarni</th>
<th>narêndrâdi Sri Jayalengkara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It was told about the kingdom of Medhang Kamulan</td>
<td>the great king of Sri Jayalengkara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>kang jumeneng nerpatine</em></td>
<td><em>ambek santa budi alus</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>who reigned as a great king</td>
<td>having a peaceful mind and smooth understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>nata dibya putus ing niti</em></td>
<td><em>asih ing wadya tantra</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>is the main king and has political science</td>
<td>love his armies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>paramartêng wadun</em></td>
<td><em>widagdêng mring kasudiran</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>has affection toward women</td>
<td>firms toward the spirit of heroism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>sida sedya putus ing agal lan alit</em></td>
<td><em>tan kênger ing aksara</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>succees in making the work physically and mentally</td>
<td>he is not unaffected by magic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reciting the Quran with Javanese style in *macapat* finally gets supporting and opposing responses of the moslem scholars to analogize it with reciting with Arabic style which accepted by moslems internationally until now. The Arabic style is arranged in style of reciting *maqamat* and *tausyih* with tones and certain intonations. Ahsin Sakho (2015) said that Arabic style comes from Persia.16 Nelson (1980), Rasmussen (2001) and Tamrin (2008) describe that the of Arabic style is from Egypt since it was be pioneered by the Egypt’s reciters.17 Nelson (1980) said that studies of the holy Quran already were focused to explain its interpretation, science of reciting the Quran (*Ilm Tajweed*), and *Qira’ât* which have been codified in the text forms.18 However, drawing a historical clear line about the Arabic style would not be an easy matter, because there is no scientific verbal data unless the transmissions from a master to his students and so on. Reciting the Quran with Arabic style has also relation to Arabic music which has been familiar in Arabic communities anciently. Many prominent Islamic-Arab philosophers have discussed about the music. The tones in reciting the Quran with Arabic style have eight scales as well as the scales in the Arabic music.19 The tones of Arabic style have spread out to the countries of Islam, such as Indonesia, Egypt, Iran, Turkey, Iraq, Malaysia and others.
Reciting the Quran with *maqamat* or Arabic style is also forbidden by some Muslim scholars initially. In Egypt, reciting the Quran with melodic style in its early days has caused resistance of a number of Muslim scholars. This resistance appears because of consensus to line a clear distinction between the holy Qur'an and poetry or between the holy Quran and music. They have called this style by term *al-Qira‘ah bil Alchân* (reciting with deviant style). Labib as-Said (1970) has noted well their debate on this issue. Despite of the controversy on reciting the Quran with *maqamat*, the art of music in Islam such as *ibtihâlât* (praise) before Subuh prayer is a legal art among Muslim communities. At this time, one of the scholars explicitly distinguishes between reciting the Quran and deviant style (*Qira‘ah bil Alchân*) is Shaykh Abu Zaid bin Bakar from Saudi Arabia.

The art of reciting the Quran with Arabic style in Indonesia was growing and spreading quickly. Indonesia plays an important role in holding competitions of reciting the Quran with Arabic style internationally since the 1990 until now. Contrarily to the condition in Egypt, the art of reciting the Quran in Indonesia is not only dominated by men Muslims but also by women Muslims since there was many women reciters. The art of recitation of the Quran with this style is known as *Lagu-lagu Quran* (songs of the Quran) or *Seni Baca Al-Quran* (art of reciting the Quran). Howard H. Federspiel assumes that the art of reciting the Quran in Indonesia to have growing as result of the art of reciting the Quran flourishing in Egypt among a number of reciters. On one hand, the Indonesian government also has supported to rise the art of reciting the Quran by holding many competitions (MTQ) since the era of KH. A. Wahid Hasyim in 1950 and formalizing it into a competition (MTQ) held every year.

In perspective of who rejects Javanese style, reciting the Quran with Javanese style is intoning the Quran which the message of Allah has banned it because it is used in traditional events in which disobedience so often happened and it is a style of expert wickedness and there is a banning to read the holy Quran with style of expert wickedness. The message of Allah said: Read the Quran with song and voice of the Arabs. Stay away from intonations (*luchûn*) of ahlkitab and godless people (*fasiq*). There will come people coming after me to read the Quran as singing and bellowing, not beyond their throats (HR. Tarmidzi).

From investigation on the sanad, the hadith is classified into the hadith *dha‘if* because one narrator of its chain was disconnected. On the other hand, all Muslim scholars agree that the Quran should be recited in accordance with the rules of *Ilm Tajweed*. Who rejects Javanese style said that reciting the Quran with Javanese style was causing the error. In order to
prove this errors in *Ilm Tajweed* which is the science of reciting the Quran, a phonological analysis on Javanese reciting is a necessary. Phonological analysis is needed in order to explain scientifically the error of the reciting. In other words, analysis of reciting the Quran is an analysis on the voice of reciting the Quran. This analysis can only be done through phonological analysis on the both of Arabic and Javanese reciting. Discussion of the phonological analysis includes various discussions of *Ilm Tajweed*, namely short and length (*mad*), voice clarity (*idhar, ikhfa’, idgham*, and so on), and also the pressure or accent.

The accents currently becomes a study concern of *Ilm Tajweed*. The discussion of accents is most important discussion of *Ilm Tajweed*. Shaikh Safwat (2001) in *Sharh Al-Jazariyah* asserts many points of accent that should be interested when reciting the Quran. Hassan (1993) also states that the miracle of the Quran rhythm will only appear through the harmony and beauty of Quranic tone and the rhythm with the proper accents. Ahmad Suyuti (2012) also includes the accents in suprasegmental elements must be focused when reciting of the Quran. Some other expert reciters (*qari’*) emphasizing that the accent in reciting the Quran are Shaykh Zayyat, Fattach Abdul Qadi, Amir Osman, Ibrahim Al-Achdlar, Ahmad Mustafa and the others.

**The Rules of Classical Arabic Accents**

Many linguists distinguish Arabic language historically into two periods; Classical and Modern period. Classical period begins from the 6th century AD which is the golden age of Arabic language with many progress in various fields. Classical period is preceded by old Arabic in about seven centuries BC. The Quran has appeared around the 7th century AD, so it could be grouped into Classical Arabic. This is also supported by linguistic characteristics appearing in language of the Quran. The language employed in the Quran is pure Arabic materials used as a reference in researches on the fields of Arabic.

The linguists, especially from the Prague School led by Vilem Mathesius (1882-1945), have started to distinguish between phonetic study and phonologic study in general linguistic studies. Phonetics in modern linguistics is the science devoted to learning the sounds, while phonology is study about functions of these sounds in a system of language. In phonetic study, phonological sounds would be studied with more detail. Phonetic study of Arabic language has raised so rapidly that it hits the all other fields of linguistics namely science of articulating of sound, science of auditing sound, science of acoustic sounds, and phonology itself. At the same time,
the linguists have divided general linguistics into several levels, namely phonology; morphology; syntax; and semantics. In phonology, sound subsequently was divided into two parts; sound of language that distinguishes meaning, it is called phonemes which afterward was included in phonology; and sound of language that does not distinguish meaning, such as tone, accent, pauses etc., that was included into the study of prosody. \(^{32}\) Although this division is too generalization in each section, but at least it could provided a clear outline relating to general linguistics studies.

There are many elements in the study of prosody, namely rhythm, accent, stress, intonation, tone, pauses, and length or duration, but only the elements of length and accent are already studied in science of reciting the Quran (Ilm Tajweed). Accent is hard or soft sound that accompanies the pronunciation on the part of the segmental speech by comparing its parts with the syllable in the words or with the word in the phrase, the clause, and the sentence. \(^{33}\) In the tonal languages, the accents have functional distinction in the words or the sentences, such as Chinese, Indian, English, and other languages. For example, the word “\textit{conduct}” (with accent on \textit{con}) means "behavior", otherwise the word \textit{conduct} (with accent of the \textit{duct}) means "manage". \(^{34}\) The rules of accent in a language may differ from the rules of other languages, e.g. the accent in Indonesian was different from English.

The classical Arabic is a language that has a number of accent like other languages in the world. \(^{35}\) Brockelmann (1963) has conducted a study on Semitic languages by contrastive diachronic and has explained that the classical Arabic is languages which has accents in its words and sentences. He also said that in addition the accent occurring on the syllable forming a word, it also occurs on the word forming a clause or a sentence. \(^{36}\) McCarthy (1979) has also explained that Arabic language is a language which has accents on its syllables. He further has set the rules of these accents. \(^{37}\) The accent of Arabic language was explained by many linguists, such as Al-`Âni (1970), Bohas (1981) and others. \(^{38}\) Hassan (1993) said that Muhammad in the reality has recited the Quran with the accents regularly as well as his companions and the expert reciters in the early period of Islam have did. The accent has been integrated well within their language character which naturally has led them to apply it in their reciting even though there was no stipulated rules of accent yet. However, after the Quran has spread abroad and the Arabic characters have faded little by little, the stipulated rules of accents became a need in the standard Arabic. \(^{39}\)
In modern phonological study of suprasegmental sounds, the accents has been the concentration of a number of researchers. Brockelmann (1963) states that regulation of accents follows regulation of word syllable. The accent is basically lies in the words from its back to front, so if a syllable was discovered with long sound, the accent lies in that long syllable. If there is no long sound in the word, the accent lies in the first syllable. Hassan (1993) also states that the accent in Arabic language is determined by syllable regulation in the Arabic words. Syllable is the smallest rhythmic unit of the result of linguistic sounds in the air stream. One syllable usually consists of one vowel and one consonant or more. Syllable shapes in the Arabic language have three kinds only, namely CV (consonants and vowels), CVC (consonant, vowel, consonant), and CVCC (consonant, vowel, double consonant). These syllables can be six syllables by make a long vowel, namely CV, CV:C, and CV:CC for examples: syllable ظنَّ (dla) of word دلارا (darab), syllable لَمْ (lam), شُعْبَ (sha`b), ما (mâ), دلَّل (dllâl) of word دلائل (dllâlin), and syllable زَادْ (nâdd). The syllable ended by a double consonant only occurs when waqf (stop), even many Arabs try to avoid double consonants in the waqf (stop) by providing a vowel (vocals) to the letter before the end, so the word شعب (sha`b) which consists of CVCC becomes CV/CVC (sha`ab). Likewise, many ancient dialects try to avoid syllable CV:C شَاب (shab) in word شاب (sha`abah). Absolutely, It was concluded that the syllable be found in Arabic language most commonly is CV and CVC.

Basically, the rule of accents described by a number of scientists is same. The author will use the rule described by Hassan (1993) because it is more detail than the rule described by McCarthy (1979), Al-`Ânî (1970) and Zahid (1999). Hassan (1993) firstly differentiates between accents on syllables in the word before structured in a sentence and accents on syllable in the word after structured in a sentence. He also differentiates between primary accents and secondary accents. Primary accents are stresses on the syllable in the word constructed with affixations to be one word such as داژکروه /fadz/ku/ru/hu/. Despite of this word consists of a conjunction, verb, and pronoun before compiled subsequently in clause or sentence, all of word’s elements are considered by Hassan as one word. Secondary accents are accents occurring in the word has several syllables deserving as two words such as شا نفاطات /shâf/fât/ (CV:C/CV:C/) which is equal to word فاط نقال /qâl/qâl/ (CV:C/CV:C/)، مستقيم /mus/ta/qîm/ (CVC/CV/CV:C/) which is equal to word جا أمس /jâ`a/ams/ (CV/CV/CVCC/) and يستبكون لياس /yas/ta/bi/qîm/ (CVC/CV/CV/CV:C/) which is equal to ليس بيون /lai/ya/ha/hûn/ (CVV/ CV/CV/ CV:C/). Secondary accents have
function to be balancing the primary accents so that the parts of word can be articulated with a balance.

The rules of primary accents are as following.⁴⁵ (Stressed syllables will be drew in bold):

1. Accent on the last syllable if it is CV:C, CVCC, or CV:CC, such as /yaʃ/ /a/ /lān/, /fa/ /al/, /a/ /barr/.
2. (2) Accent on syllable of the word that only has one syllable, whatever is it; CV /qi/, CVC /qul/, CV: /ma/, and others.
3. Accent on syllable before last in following forms: (a.) syllable before last is CV when last syllable is CV, CVC, or CV if the word has two syllables or three with hamzah washol in first, such /ukh/ /ru/ji/, /shu/war/, and so on; (b.) syllable before the last is CVC or CV: if the last syllable is CV, CVC, or CV, such /al /lim/, مقاتلات /mu/ /qa/til/, /astوثق /is/ /tau/ /tsiq/ and so on; (c.) syllable before last is CV:C if the last syllable is not CV: C or CVCC, such as /dlâl /lah/, and other examples.
4. Accent on second syllable before last if the second syllable is CV, CVC, CV:, or CVCC and two syllables thereafter is CV/CV, CV/CV:, or CV/CVC, such as /al /la/ /na/ /ka/, علمكم /al /la/ /ma/ /kum/, /bai /na/ /kum/, and others.
5. Accent on third syllable before last syllable if the last is CV, CV: or CVC and all syllables before is CV, such as /dla/ /ra/ /ba/ /ka/, بقشة /ba/ /qa/ /ra/ /tun/, /nakr /na/ /ki/ /ra/ /hum/, and others.
6. Accents may not occur before third syllable. In other words, the primary accent will be only on the third syllable before last syllable in the word or after it.

Secondary accents occurring before the primary accent provide balance in sound of the words. Following are the rules of secondary accents. (Secondary accent will be drew in bold and underlined):

1. Secondary accents on syllable before primary accent if it is CV:C such as /ash/ /ʃâʃ/ /fât/, /a/ /tu/ /châʃ/ /ʃûn/ /nî/, etc.
2. Secondary accent on second syllable before primary accent if this second is CVC or CV if the syllable between the secondary and primary accents syllable CV, CVC, or CV:like /mus/ /ta/ /qim/, /mus /tab /qin/, /mus /ta/ /qim/, /a/ /shar/ /na/ /hum/, and so on.
3. Secondary accent on third syllable before primary accent in the following forms: (a.) third syllable is CV and it is separated by two CV
such asِ /ka/\li/ma/ tân/, وكتباه /ka/\ta/\ba/ tâ/ hu/; (b.) third syllable is CV: or CVC and it is separated by two CVs such as /yas/\ta/\bi/ qûn/ or separated by CV, CV: or CVC, such as /yas/\ta/\qi/ mûn/.

The primary and secondary accents explained above occur at the word level which means the word in orthography terms. Hassan (1993) explains that Arabic words are quite diverse. An Arabic word may consist of one syllable and others may have seven syllables such as /fa/\sa/\ya/\k/\f/\h/\mu/\o/\u/\a/\t/\t/\a/\m/. Eventually, it is can said that among an accent to another (either primary accent or secondary accent) in the Arabic word may has one syllable, two, or three syllables which get not stress. Repetition of accents in a sentence there will show the rhythm of the recitation. Hassan (1993) has applied the rules of accents with several verses, one of them is 19th verse of Surah al-Baqarah:

أَّْ كَصَِّ٘ ٍ هِيَ   سَّوَاءِ فَِِ٘ ظُلُوَاثٌ َّزَعْدٌ َّبَسْقٌ َٗجْ َلُْىَ أَصَابِ َُِنْ فِٖ آَذَ ًِِِِنْ هِيَ   صََّْ عِكِ

In this verse, the primary accents and secondary accents have been visible. When that analysis of accents is applied into the first verse of Surah Al-Isra’, then the accents will be such as following:

سُبْحَاىَ   َّرِٕ أَسْسَٓ بِ َبْدٍِِ  َْ٘لاا هِيَ   ْوَسْجِدِ   ْحَسَ مِ إِ َٔ   ْوَسْجِدِ  لَْْلْصَٔ   َّرِٕ بَازَكٌَْا

In short, /sub/\châ/\nal/ (CVC/CV/CVC) receives stress according to rule of accent P3B (primary accent, number 3, point (b)). /La\d\zj\i/ (CV/CV:) and /as/\r\a/ (CVC/CV:) according to rule of accents P3A and P3B (primary accent, number 3 point (a) and primary accent,
numbers 3, point (b.)). ‘Ab in /bi/’aβ/di/hî/ (CV/CVC/CV/CV:) receives stress according to P4 (primary accent, number 4). Lai in /lai/’alam/ (CV/CVC) receives stress according to P3B (primary accent, number 3, point (b.)). Mi in /mi/’nal/ (CV/CVC) according to P3A. Mas in /mas/’ji/dil/ (CVC/CVC) and cha in /cha/’râ/’mi/ (CV/CVC) according to P4. ‘i in /’i/lal/ (CV/CVC) according to P3A. ‘Aq in /’aq/shâl/ (CVC/CVC) according to P3B. Bâ in /bâ/’rak/nâ/ (CV:/CVC/CV:) according to P4. Chau in /chau/la/hû/ (CV/CVC/CV:) according to P4. Li (CV) according to P.2. Ri syllable in /nu/’ri/ya/hû/ (CV/ CV/ CV/CV:) according to P4. Min at /min/ (CVC) according to P2. Yà in /’à/’yâ/’ti/nâ/ (CV:/CVC:/ CV/CV:) according to P4. In in /’in/’na/hû/ (CVC/CVC/CV:) according to P4. Hu in /hu/’was/ (CV/CVC) according to P3A. Mîn /sa/mî/’ul/ (CV/CVC:/CVC) according to P3B. And shîr in /ba/shîr/ (CV/CVC:C) according to P1.

In this first verse of Surah Al-Isra’, all of the accents are primary accents, because there is no long word which was constructed from some syllables and deserved equivalent with two words. The author hen would analyze Yasser Arafat’s recitation of the same verse with Javanese style by an imaging technique using Speech Analyzer program as analytical instrument to determine its accents. The author subsequently would analyze the same verse recited by KH. Muammar ZA and H. Chumaidi. When the accents of both recitations have been know, the author will compare according to the rules of accents in that verse as well asexplained above. The imaging techniques using Speech Analyzer program has been used by linguists as whole and obtained an adequate analytical accuracy. The accent in a speech that has been recorded can be determined by the technique to compare sound of its word’s syllables. Characteristic of prosodic sound which has accents can be shown by the amplitude of segmental pronunciation. In addition, Speech Analyzer program also can be used to determine frequencies required in uttering prosodic sound and accents spoken aloud or high-pitched, either accents occurring at the words in sentences or at syllables in words as will be more explained below.

Accents of Recitation with Javanese Style (Langgam)

The author will analyze Yasser Arafat’s reciting as data of recitation with Javanese style. In many online news, the Yasser Arafat’s reciting was called using macapatDandanggula, although the author perceives that it is macapat Mijil, not Dandanggula, especially first verse of Surah Al-Isra. Mijil means ‘go out’ which contains the meaning of time, place, and circumstances. Islamic mission (da’ wah) should be given in right time, right
place, and enough time in order to accommodate the listeners. Anyone spreads Islam must ready to venture and carry out whatever required in the way of Allah. *Macapat Mijilis* created and composed by Sunan Gunung Jati. The analyzed stress here is stress at the syllables of words or phrases structured in a clause or sentence, these stresses are called by accents. To mark the accent, the linguist use symbol (+) for syllable receiving accent and symbol (-) for syllable not receiving accent, but in order to be easier, the author will use bold character to mark syllables getting accents in this paper.

In this Javanese recitation, the reciter (qari`) recites first verse of Surah Al-Isra twice. In each reciting, he stops (waqf) three times. First, *waqaf dharûriy* (emergency stop) that is due to run out of breath in the middle of reciting. This stop is at phrase المسجد الحرام / al-Masjid charâm /. Second, *waqaf jaiz* (allowed stop) that Mushaf normally uses symbol (ج) over the word. This stop is at phrase آٗاحٌا/ Ayâtînâ/. Third, *waqaf tâm* (perfect stop) is at the end of the verse when reciter has finished his reciting.

From the analysis of recitation of first verse of Al-Isra` in the first recitation, the author founds accents as following:

These accents were found available from first reciting at the first stop:

```
| sub | châ | nal | la | dzî | `as | râ | bi | `ab | di | hî | lâi | lam | mi | nal |
```

The accents of first reciting at the second stop are as following:

```
| mi | nal | mas | jî | dil | cha | râ | mi | i` | lal | mas | jî | dil | `a | q | shal |
```

The accents of first reciting at third stop are:

```
| in | na | hû | hu | was | sa | mi | `ul | ba | shîr |
```

At the first word *sub/châ/nal/*, the accent occurs at the second syllable *châ*. This is appropriate with the rules of linguistic accents. Frequency of the accent is about 85 Hz to 100 Hz with a duration of about 650 milliseconds.

![Figure 01: Word subchânal /sub/ /châ/ /nal/](image)
The low stress appears in the figure at the first syllable /sub/ because reciter is starting his reciting, but the high stress with long duration is given to the second syllable /chā/ which was getting up and being stable. In figure 01, there is repeated sound of consonant baʿ (be) between /sub/ and /chā/. The repeated sound of baʿ is due to rule of Ilm Tajweed called by qalqalah (repetition of consonant sound). Qalqalah occurs as some consonants without vowel has some strong characteristics such as noise bursts (syiddah) or loud voice (jahā). The consonants that have sound like this are consonants qaf, thaʿ, jim, baʿ, and dal. But in this reciting, there is wrong sound of qalqalah found several times, especially sound of consonant lam and sin such as following:

![Figure 02: Phrase Minal Masjidil /mi/nal/mas/ji/dil](image)

In this figure, articulation of lam takes duration about 400 milliseconds between millisecond 15,400 until millisecond 15,800. The repetition of sound sin also appears in the word asrā which was pronounced /as/s/ra/ with double /s/ such as following:

![Figure 03: Word asrā /as/rā/](image)

The repetition of lam and sin can be explained by three probabilities. First, the reciter (qariʿ) needs to adjust tones of his reciting with tones of macapat. Second, the duration of pronunciation of lam and sin is too long therefore it is to be almost equal to duration of one syllable. Third, the reciter want to clarify sound of the consonant which its articulation is
adjacent to the next consonant where the consonant lam is a dental consonants pronounced with loud sound (jahr) without explode (syiddah) and the consonant sin is an alveolar consonant pronounced with voiceless (hams). In the first reciting, the interesting note is the accent in the phrase /minal masjidil/. It was shifting to be /minalmasjidil/ in second stop. See the comparison below:

The absence of accent at syllable /dil/ in the first stop because the reciter stops to take a breather, so that the accent was losing and he immediately process with the next word in the second stop, so his sound was strong. The accent frequency of syllable /dil/ in the first stop is about 45 Hz and 50 Hz and the accent at that syllable /dil/ in the second stop is about 100 Hz.

The next accent is at syllable /mas/ in phrases /mas/ji/dil/ /aq/shal/. Two accents (‘aq/shal) seem without a separator, but actually both is separated by repetition of sound consonant qaf that is repeated because of qalqalah. The word /ladzi/ has missed accent due to adjust the tones of macapat chosen by reciter, see it below:
There is accent at first and third syllable of word /bâ/ra/ˈk/nâ/, these accents are because of intonation of macapat followed by the reciter. The frequency at the first syllable is between 80 Hz and 100 Hz and between 80 Hz and 95 Hz at the second. The next is at the last syllable and before the last of word /chau/ˈla/hû/ which followed by accent at conjunctive /li/ then second syllable before the last and the last syllable of word /nu/ri/ˈya/hû/. The first stop was closed by the accent at the second and third syllable before the last of phrase /min/ /ˈ â/ya/ˈti/nâ/. The accent at second syllable before the last is appropriate with the rules of accents, while the accent at the first syllable is because of song tones. If the frequency of both accents are compared, then the greater stress has beenat the first syllable ranging between 80 Hz and 100 Hz and the accent at the second is only between 85 Hz and 95 Hz.

In the last stop, the important note is that there is not any accent at last syllable of the word which closes the verse. Last syllable that takes the longest duration of about 6.450 milliseconds was initially under an accent, but further the accent was down to frequency 45 Hz after getting 96 Hz.

The author further analyzes the second reciting of the same verse. Repetition of the same verse like this is not regulated, but the reciter was
Nur Faizin, From Arabic Style toward Javanese Style

recited it twice. There is difference of accent between first and second reciting. Following are accents of the second reciting:

First stop of second reciting: /sub/châ/ nal/ /la/dzî/ /`as/râ/ /bi/ `ab/di/hî/ /lai/lam/ /mi/nal/ /mas/ji/dil/ /cha/râm/  
Third stop of second reciting: `/i/in/ na/hû/ /hu/was/ /sa/mi/ `ul/ /ba/shîr/53

Frequency of the accent in the word /sub/châ/ nal/ is between 80 Hz and 145 Hz. The accent was given to repeated consonant ba according to rule of qalqalah. Second syllable /châ/ also gets a bit of stress because of the influence of the tone that was down slowly from the previous syllable. In the word /la/dzî/, the accent is given to the first syllable in which the lowest frequency is between 85 Hz and 97 Hz. Let see the following:

Figure 08: Phrase Subchânal ladzî /sub/châ/ nal/ /la/dzî/

The two syllables of word /`as/râ/ in the second reciting get an accent in which the highest frequency is 97 Hz. The enough high accent is given to syllable which is closed by consonant ba of word /hî/ `ab/in/hî/ and it has the highest frequency of 110 Hz. The syllable /hî/ getting accent in the first reciting did not get accent in the second reciting, especially when compared with other syllables, but it was tend to be balancing despite of fluctuating intonation of the second reciting. The next accent is at syllable /lai/ by frequency of 84 Hz to 99 Hz and also syllable /lam/ which has frequency between 83 Hz and 99 Hz. The accent of word /mi/nal/ is given to the second syllable. There is difference of the word /mas/ji/dil/ between the first reciting in which the accent was given to the first syllable and the second reciting in which the accent was given to last syllable with frequency between 81 Hz and 100 Hz. The next accent was given to syllable /cha/ by the highest frequency of 98 Hz and the syllable /râm/ received frequency between 80 Hz and 99 Hz and it is higher than the previous accent. In the
second reciting, the reciter has given higher accent to these syllables than those in the first reciting. Let see following:

In the second stop of second reciting, the accent was given at the second syllable of word /mi/nal/ with frequency between 81 Hz and 100 Hz and has taken duration of 700 milliseconds. The consonant lam here appeared to be repeated wrongly. In the next word /mas/ji/dil/, the accent is given to the last syllable /dil/ which was closed by consonant lam repeated one more. The first syllable /mas/ did not get the accent as the first reciting. The accent in the word /i/lal/ is at second syllable and first and in the word /mas/ji/dil/ is at first and third syllable and its frequency is between 84 Hz and 101 Hz. The first accent of word /aq/shal/ is between 83 Hz and 99 Hz and the second is between 85 Hz and 98 Hz. The word /la/dzi/ gets accent at the second syllable with a long duration. The word /bâ/rak/nâ gets accent on the first syllable with frequency 88 Hz until 97 Hz. The first and last syllable of the word /chau/lu/hû/ also take accents. The accent in the phrase /lí/ /nu/ri/ya/hû/ is at the last syllable and syllable before it with a frequency between 83 Hz and 104 Hz. The accent in the word /â/yâ/ti/nâ/ occurs on the first syllable with a high frequency between 80 Hz and 120 Hz and frequency of the second syllable is between 79 Hz and 98 Hz.
The accent in the third stop of second reciting is given by reciter to the second syllable of word /‘in/na/hû/ which has a nasal sound as result of two consonants nun. The frequency is on the second syllable between 81 Hz and 99 Hz. The next accent is at the second syllable of word /hu/was/ between 86 Hz and 102 Hz. The accent is also at last syllable of word /sa/mî/‘ul/. The accent with high frequency is at last syllable closing the second reciting namely at the word /ba/shîr/ which its frequency is seen between 87 Hz and 123 Hz. This accent occurs at the end of a long sound which spent 3,500 milliseconds. In addition to the intonation of the song, this long duration is also suitable with Ilm Tajweed. The accent given to the last syllable is also suitable with the rule of accents in modern phonology. Let see following:

![Figure 11: Word bashîr /ba/shîr/](image)

Eventually, it can be concluded that the reciting the Quran with Javanese style has a number of suitability with the rule of accents in phonological theory described by the experts of modern linguists, although there were also some wrong accents. In addition to these accents, the author found repetition of sound of consonant ba and qaf which are suitable with Ilm Tajweed (science of reciting the Quran) and a repetition of sound of consonant lam and sin closing some syllables in the number of words and it is not suitable with the rule of science of reciting the Quran.

**Accents of Recitation with Arabic Style (Nagham)**

Indonesian reciters often win the competition of reciting the Quran with Arabic style at international level also. One of them is KH. Mummar ZA who was won the competition of the art of reciting the Quran with Arabic style in the 1980s and he was reciting first verse of Surah Al-Isra’ in duet with H. Chumaidi. The reciting was using maqamat Rast which is the foundation for all scales in the art of Arabic music in which its tone steps are arranged in a rhythm and natural style such as decided in the first conference of Arabic music in Cairo 1932.⁵⁴
The first verse was recited by KH. Muammar ZA and H. Chumaidi four times. In the first reciting, it was recited by KH. Muammar ZA with maqamat Rast and he stoped (waqf) at phrase /Masjidil/ /charâm/. The second reciting then was recited by H. Humaidi who also stoped (waqf) at phrase /Masjidil/ /charâm/. The third reciting was recited by duet of them starting from the start of verse until the end. The fourth reciting was recited by H. Chumaidi starting from the last sentence of verse that is innahu huwas sami’ul bashîr.

The author analyzed reciting the first verse of Surah Al-Isra’ by imaging technique with using Speech Analyzer program. The author found results as the following (these bold syllables are accents): /sub/châ/nal/ /la/dzî/ /`as/râ/ /bi/`ab/dî/hî/ /lai/lam/ /mi/nal/ /mas/ji/dil/ /cha/râm/. The accents in the second reciting are such as following: /sub/châ/nal/ /la/dzî/ /`as/râ/ /bi/`ab/dî/hî/ /lai/lam/ /mi/nal/ /mas/ji/dil/ /cha/râm/. Although the second reciting was using same kind of maqamat, there are many differences of accent positions. That is because the accent is suprasegmental sound elements which are not same as intonations or tones. In the first reciting, the accent is not given to the first syllable but to the consonant ba(qalqalah)repeated due to rule of qalqalah while in the second reciting it is given directly to the first syllable. The frequency of the accent in the both is not different, it is about 80 Hz to 100 Hz. Let see the following:

Figure 11: Word Subchânal in first reciting

Figure 12: Word Subchânal in second reciting
In the third reciting, the verse completely was recited by duet voice, the accents occurred such as following: /sub/châ/nal/ /la/dzî/ /`as/ râ/ /bi/ `ab/di/hû/ /lai/lam/ /mi/ nal/ /mas/ji/dîl/ /cha/ râ/mi/ /`i/ lal/ /mas/ji/dîl/ /`aq/shal/ /la/dzî/ /bâ/râk/ nâ/ /chau/ la/hû/ /`i/ /nu/`î/ya/ hû/ /mîn/ /`û/`ya/`î/ nâ/ /`in/ na/hû/ /hu/ was/ /sa/ mî/ `ul/ /ba/shîr/. In the fourth reciting, the accents are such as following: /`in/ na/hû/ /hu/ was/ /sa/ mî/ `ul/ /ba/shîr/.

There are differences of accent positions between third and fourth reciting, especially at the last two words. In the third reciting, the accent was given to all syllables of them while in the fourth reciting, it is given to the first and last syllable of them. Repetition of sound lam and sin in this reciting did not often appear as well as appears in reciting with Javanese style. Repetition of consonant lam appears in Javanese recitation in some phrases, for example: phrase /mas/ji/dîl/ /l/cha/râ/mi/ and verb /as/ /s/ /râ/. The author found repetition of consonant lam only once in phrase /sub/châ/nal/ /l/ /la/dzî/ that occurs without frequency of accent such as following:

The different repetition of consonant sound between Arabic style and Javanese style can be explained by two probabilities. First, internal probability that is because the tones of Arabic style does not require the repetition of consonant sound as well as that of Javanese style. Second,
external probability that is because the reciter has not proficient to recitewith Javanese style and the reciter of Arabic style has good proficiency to recite the verse with Arabic style. Eventually, the author conclude that these possibilities are two factors might obstruct to say that the Javanese style itself is the single cause which takes over any mistake in the two recitations of the Quran, especially mistakes of accents or other mistakes in *Ilm Tajweed* perspective.

**Comparison Between Arabic Style (*Nagham*) and Javanese Style (*Langgam*)**

In this part, the author want to compare both of Arabic style and Javanese style which have been used as a style to recite the first verse of Surah Al-Isra with the rule of accents described in Classical Arabic language and used by Muhammad and his companions to recite the Quran in the prophetic era. This comparison is to analyze the suitability of two styles with rule of accents arranged by experts Arabic language sciences. The author then could conclude by this comparison about permissibility or prohibition of both styles which based on the theory of accents in Arabic Classical language after the fact that there is not any ideological reason to reject both of Arabic style and Javanese style in reciting the holy Quran.

The different accents existing in each style, either Arabic style or Javanese style, will be considered as a variant that complements regulatory suitability with the rules of accents, not be considered as a variant that reduces it. That is because this research is a comparative research which aim to make differences closer, not to build differences as in a contrastive research. In order to facilitate this comparison, so that the author draws this following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>First Verse of Al-Isra` Chapter</th>
<th>Rule of Accents</th>
<th>Javanese Style</th>
<th>Arabic Style</th>
<th>Accuration of Accents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>سْبْحَاىَ</td>
<td>/sub/châ/nal/</td>
<td>/sub/châ/nal/</td>
<td>/sub/châ/nal/</td>
<td>V X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>الَّذِى</td>
<td>/la/dzî/</td>
<td>/la/dzî/</td>
<td>/la/dzî/</td>
<td>V V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>أَسْتَزَى</td>
<td>/`as/râ/</td>
<td>/`as/râ/</td>
<td>/`as/râ/</td>
<td>X X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>يَعَيِّدُهُ</td>
<td>/bi/`ab/dî/hî/</td>
<td>/bi/`ab/dî/hî/</td>
<td>/bi/`ab/dî/hî/</td>
<td>V X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>لَِلَّا</td>
<td>/lai/`al/</td>
<td>/lai/`al/</td>
<td>/lai/`al/</td>
<td>X V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>مِن</td>
<td>/mi/nal/</td>
<td>/mi/nal/</td>
<td>/mi/nal/</td>
<td>X V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>المَسْجِدِ</td>
<td>/mas/jî/dî/</td>
<td>/mas/jî/dî/</td>
<td>/mas/jî/dî/</td>
<td>V V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>الحَزَامِ</td>
<td>/cha/râ/mi/</td>
<td>/cha/râm/mi/</td>
<td>/cha/râm/mi/</td>
<td>V X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>إِلَى</td>
<td>/`i/lal/</td>
<td>/`i/lal/</td>
<td>/`i/lal/</td>
<td>X V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>المَسْجِدِ</td>
<td>/mas/jî/dî/</td>
<td>/mas/jî/dî/</td>
<td>/mas/jî/dî/</td>
<td>V X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>الأَفْقَىَ</td>
<td>/`aq/shal/</td>
<td>/`aq/shal/</td>
<td>/`aq/shal/</td>
<td>X V</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results of this comparison showed that the Arabic style has more suitability with rule of accents than Javanese style. The reciting with Arabic style has suitability by 9 of 21 words in first verse of Surah Al-Isra` and the reciting with Javanese style just has suitability by 6 of 21 words. Nevertheless, both of two styles are not two suitable recitations with the rule of accents as designed in the classical Arabic phonological theory.

**Conclusion**

The controversy among the Islamic communities and the expert scholars regarding reciting the holy Quran with Javanese style indeed has been happened. Many reasons, proofs, and arguments already have been delivered to affirm both of accepting and rejecting opinion, but after the analysis explained above, the author could conclude that:

First, from history perspective, it is known that Javanese style (macapat) was not style of godless people. The Islamic missionaries of Java (Wali Songo) have been used macapat to call humankind into Islam and to spread its guidelines. The Arabic style (nagham) has been rejected in its first days as well as the Javanese style today and it is known that hadith considered to reject any styles of non-Arab is weak (dhaiif), therefore it is necessary to analyze it linguistically in order to find scientific argument suitable with Ilm Tajweed.

Second, the accents (an-Nabr or stress) in reciting the Quran with Javanese style has suitability with rules of the accents almost 30% and about 43% with Arabic style. Each percentage is from 21 orthographic words contained in the first verse of Surah Al-Isra`. Recitation with Javanese style would need much attentions, especially in articulation of consonant sounds, so that there is not any repetition which conflict with the rule of Ilm Tajweed, such as repetition of lam and sin.
Third, although Arabic style has been known in the Islamic world, the recitation of the Quran in Arabic style is also not always suitable with the rules of accents and the Arabic style has suitability more than Javanese style and has error repetition of articulation of consonant less than Javanese style.

Fourth, the rejecting Javanese style is improper rejection when the reason is due to use certain tones of intonations therefore many errors were happen, especially in matters of accents which should be given when reciting the Quran. That is because the reciting the Quran with Arabic style that recognized by the entire international Islamic world also have not suitability completely with the rules of accents in linguistic perspective.

Fifth, consequently, the people who have received Arabic style as the art of reciting the Quran should also accept reciting the Quran with the Javanese style, because in terms of linguistic perspective, both of two styles really have suitability and unsuitability with the rules described by Arabic linguists and Islamic scholars at the time. The rejection of reciting the Quran with Javanese style has not any reason and it could not be proofed by logical argument.

Endnotes:

1 email: nurfaizin@gmail.com
2 Maqamat in Arabic music scales is based on the tones that have character and the distance measured by a particular motive. Music in Western know do, re, mi, fa, so, la, si, do (See: Nelson, Kristina, The Art of Reciting the Quran, (Ph.D dissertation of the University of California, Berkeley, 1980), p. 18). Tausyih is the text read to be example of maqamat system, such as this tausyih to maqamat Rast:

4 The word nagham taken from the Arabic word that can be translated to the tones or pitch.
5 Nelson, Kristina, p. 299
6 Salim, Shafwat Machmud, Syarch Fatch Rabb Al-Bariyyah Muqaddimah `Ala Al-Jazariyyah, (Jeddah, Maktabah Malik Fahd, 2001), p. 64
7 Hassan, Tammam, Al-Bayan fi Rawā’i il Qur’ān, (Cairo, Alamul Marifah, 1993), p. 257
The Arabic style will be explained further in the sub of "Accents of Recitation in Arabic style"

Javanese styles by Yasser Arafat is accessible at: www.youtube.com/watch?v=N2bi43uSdgY and Arab styles by Muammar Za accessed at: www.youtube.com/watch?v=_OhF10fJQqs


Purwadi, Da’wah Sunan Kalijaga; (Yogyakarta, Pustaka Pelajar, 2007), p. 18-25

Widodo, Sri, Festival Nabhuh Gamelan, (Surakarta, Cenderawasih, 1996), p. 5


Macapat was accessed on June 2, 2016 in: http://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Macapat

Sakho, Ahsin states that Arabic style is a part of the culture as a style that is already known in Indonesia who came from Persia. He said that "Historical way of reciting the Qurran comes from Iran. Many Arabs who learn to Persian, and Iran. There are 40 types of recitation of the Quran, but the considered types are may be only seven (See: http://mui.or.id/mui/homepage/berita/berita-singkat/rektor-iiq-sangat-boleh-baca-al-quran-langgam-indonesia.html (June 3, 2015)


Lazim, Arram Fadlil, At-Tajweed Baina al-Qurani wa al-Dzaauq al-Qur’âni, (Maktabah Iliktroniyyah, without date), p. 33

Nelson, Kristina, p. 105.

Anna M. Gade, An Envy of Goodness: Learning to Recite the Quran in Modern Indonesia, (USA, Ph.D dissertation Chicago Illinois, 1999), p. 256-258


Salim, Shafwat Machmud, p. 64

Hassan, Tammam, p. 272

Nasution, Ahmad Sayuti, p. 91


Chaer, Abdul, Linguistik Umum, (Jakarta, Rineke Cipta, 2007), p. 351

Nasution, Ahmad Sayuti, Fonetik dan Fonologi dalam Al-Quran, (Jakarta, Ahmaz, 2010), p. 2

Zahid, Chamid Abdul, An-Nabr wa al-Kalima Qaw a`idhu fi al-lughah al-`Arabiyah, (Marocco, Dar Li Thibâ` ah wa an-Nasyr, 1999), p. 10
Recitations originally mean reading in general activity, but mostly the term is used to distinguish between reading plain text called read (qira’ah) and reading the sacred texts of the Qurran (recitation). Here the authors use as the equivalent maqamat with Arabic style.

\[\text{Waqf dharûri} \text{ is stop for suffocation while the verse is still quite long. Waaf ja’iz means may be stop or continue. Waaf tâm is stop at the end of the sentence that has been perfect (As-Suyuthiy, Al-Itqan fi Ulûmil Qur`ân, (Beirut, Darul Kutub Ilmiyyah 1996), p. 227)\]

\[\text{Nasution, Ahmad Sayuti, p. 87}\]

\[\text{Anis, Ibrahim, Al-Ashwât Al-Lughawiyah, (Cairo, Maktabah An-Nahdalah Al-Mishriyyah, 1986), p 115. and Nasution, Ahmad Sayuti, p. 43}\]

\[\text{The underlined syllables indicate difference of accents between the first and second recitations.}\]

\[\text{Lazim, Fadlil Arram, p. 35}\]

\[\text{Bibliography}\]

- Anis, Ibrahim, Al-Ashwât Al-Lughawiyah, Maktabah An-Nahdalah Al-Mishriyyah, Kairo, 1986

- As-Suyuthiy, Al-Itqân Fi Ulûmil Qur`ân, Darul Kutub Ilmiyyah Beirut, 1996

- Chaer, Abdul, Linguistik Umum, Rineke Cipta, Jakarta, 2007
- Gade, Anna M, An Envy of Goodness: Learning to Recite the Quran in Modern Indonesia, Ph.D Dissertation, Chicago Illinois, 1999
- Gusmian, Islah, Al-Quran dalam Pergumulan Muslim Indonesia, Afkar Journal, Jakarta, 2004: 2889-7765
- Hassan, Tammam, Al-Bayān Fī Rawā`i il Qur`ān, Alamul Kutub, Cairo, Egypt, 1993
- Holes, Clive, Modern Arabic Structures, Functions, and Varieties, Grorgetwon University Press, Washinton. DC, 2004
- Kridalaksana, Harimurti, Kamus Linguistik, Gramedia, Jakarta, 1993
- Lazim, Fadlil Arram, Baina At-Tajwīd Al-Qurānī wa Adz-Dzauq Al-Qur`ānī, Maktabah Iliktroniyyah, -
- Marsono, Fonetik, Gadjah Mada University Press, Yogyakarta, 2008
- Nelson, Kristina, 1980, The Art of Reciting The Quran, Ph.D disertasi of Universitas California, Berkeley, -
- Purwadi, Dakwah Sunan Kalijaga; Penyebaran Agama Islam Berbasis Kultural, Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta, 2007
- Sālim, Shafwat Machmūd, Syarch Fatch Rabb Al-Bariyyah `Ala Muqaddimah AlJazariyyah, Maktabah Malik Fahd, Jeddah, 2001
- Umar, Ahmad Mukhtār, Dirāsāt Ash-Shawt Al-Lughawi, Alam Al-Kutub, Kairo, 1998

ONLINE:

- [www.youtube.com/watch?v=N2bi43uSdgY](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=N2bi43uSdgY)
- [www.youtube.com/watch?v=_OhF10fjQqs](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_OhF10fjQqs)
- [http://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Macapat](http://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Macapat)